

# STATE OF OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

#### **OFFICIAL MINUTES**

December 6, 2024

381 Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting December 6, at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Conference Room of the offices of the Oklahoma State Board of Licensure for Professional Engineers & Land Surveyors located at 220 N.E. 28<sup>th</sup> St, Ste, 120, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 400 NE 50<sup>th</sup> St, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma and at the Oklahoma State Board of Licensure for Professional Engineers & Land Surveyors located at 220 N.E. 28<sup>th</sup> St, Ste, 120, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Wednesday, December 4, 2024, at 9:30 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on November 27, 2024, and posted to the REAB website on December 4, 2024. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

I. <u>CALL TO ORDER.</u> Aaron S. Emerson called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:

Glen Mulready

Aaron S. Emerson Lee R. Caesar, Jr. Richard Broughton Brandon J. Witt Michael Willard Davonna Milam

Board members excused:

Alex Trinidad

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Julie Reding, Comm. Counsel; Jenelle LePoint, Administrative Officer; Kelly Reynolds, Legal Secretary; Rex Duncan; Rachel Lawrence Mor; Kelly White and Donna White.

### II. READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES. (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Witt moved that the reading of the minutes of the November 1, 2024, session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Caesar. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Caesar Mr. Witt Mr. Emerson

Mr. Emerson Yes
Mr. Broughton Yes
Ms. Milam Yes

Yes

Yes

Mr. Willard Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

III. <u>Discussion and Possible Action Regarding a Recommendation of Dismissal by the Board's Prosecutor as to Complaint #24-008; in the Matter of James K. White; to include any Associated Matters or Motions.</u> (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Witt is recused as Probable Cause Committee Chair associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Rex Duncan, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to dismiss the Complaint listed in Agenda Item III. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Caesar Yes
Mr. Emerson Yes
Mr. Broughton Yes
Ms. Milam Yes
Mr. Willard Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

## V. <u>CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT</u>. (No Report)

#### VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. (No Report)

#### **DIRECTOR'S REPORT.**

A. Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for nonpayment of annual fees due September 30, 2024. (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

**ROLL CALL VOTE:** 

Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Emerson	Yes
Mr. Broughton	Yes
Ms. Milam	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due from January 31, 2025, and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar, to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the individuals listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

**ROLL CALL VOTE:** 

Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Emerson.	Yes
Mr. Broughton	Yes
Ms. Milam	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for appraisal management companies. (No Report)
- D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by January 31, 2025, and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Ms. Milam to approve Board staff to issue a renewal certificate to each of the applicants listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Emerson	Yes
Mr. Broughton	Yes
Ms. Milam	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. <u>Discussion and Possible Action Regarding a Consent Order as to Complaint #23-019 and Complaint # 23-032; in the Matter of Cassie A. Everett; to include any Associated Matters or Motions.</u> (Exhibit "G")

Mr. Witt is recused as Probable Cause Committee Chair associated with review of this complaint.

After a brief presentation by Rex Duncan and Rachel Lawrence Mor, Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to go into executive session. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Caesar Yes
Mr. Emerson Yes
Mr. Broughton Yes
Ms. Milam Yes
Mr. Willard Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

There being no objection, the Board's Prosecutor remained in the Executive Session to address the Consent Order he negotiated on behalf of the Board. The presence of the Board's Prosecutor in the Executive Session [thus involved confidential Communications between a Public Body and its Attorney (25 O.S. Sec. 307(B)(4))] as his presence involved the questioned Consent Order related to engaging in deliberations or rendering a final or intermediate decision in an individual proceeding pursuant to Article II of the APA (25 O.S. Sec. 307 (B)(8), a matter for which the Motion for Executive Session was made, seconded, and approved).

After coming back into regular session, the Chair ordered a roll call with the following results:

ROLL CALL:

Mr. Mulready Yes
Mr. Caesar Yes
Mr. Witt Yes
Mr. Emerson Yes
Mr. Broughton Yes
Ms. Milam Yes
Mr. Willard Yes

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton to adopt the Consent Order listed in Agenda Item IV. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

**ROLL CALL VOTE:** 

Mr. Caesar Yes
Mr. Emerson Yes
Mr. Broughton Yes
Ms. Milam Yes
Mr. Willard Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, NONE OPPOSED AND NONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

## VI. <u>COMMITTEE REPORTS.</u>

## A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. (Exhibit "H")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Willard to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item V. A. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Caesar Yes
Mr. Witt Yes
Mr. Emerson Yes
Mr. Broughton Yes
Ms. Milam Yes
Mr. Willard Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

## B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "I")

Mr. Emerson made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt, to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VI. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

**ROLL CALL VOTE:** 

Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Emerson	Yes
Mr. Broughton	Yes
Ms. Milam	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- 2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "J")
- (A) Mr. Broughton made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Witt, to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 2. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Emerson	Yes
Mr. Broughton	Yes
Ms. Milam	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- 3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "K")
- (A) Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton, to allow staff to be given the authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 3. A. The Chari ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

**ROLL CALL VOTE:** 

Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Emerson	Yes
Mr. Broughton	Yes
Ms. Milam	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

4. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist the Education, Experience and Testing Committee. (No Report)

- C. Legislation & Rules Committee. (No Report).
- D. Probable Cause Committee.
- 1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)
- 2. Discussion and possible action regarding standard operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. (No Report)
- 3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (No Report)
- VII. <u>Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Appointment of a Board Member as Vice-Chairman for the Calendar Year 2025.</u>

Mr. Witt made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Willard to allow Mr. Emerson to remain Vice-Chairman for the Calendar Year 2025 as to Agenda Item VII. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

**ROLL CALL VOTE:** 

Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Emerson	Yes
Mr. Broughton	Yes
Ms. Milam	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. <u>Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Appointment of Board Members as Co-Chairs of the Board's Three Standing Committees: Legislative & Rules Committee; Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee; and Education, Experience & Testing Committee, for the Calendar Year 2025. (Exhibit "L")</u>

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the current Co-Chairs remain the same as to Agenda Item VIII. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Emerson	Yes
Mr. Broughton	Yes
Ms. Milam	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes
Ms. Milam	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

#### Davonna Milam left the meeting.

IX. <u>Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Appointment of Individuals to Education, Experience & Testing Committee; Legislation and Rules Committee; and Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee with Concurrent Appointment as Appraiser Hearing Officers for the Calendar Year 2025.</u> (Exhibit "M")

Mr. Caesar made a Motion, and it was seconded by Mr. Broughton that the current appointments remain the same as to Agenda Item IX. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

**ROLL CALL VOTE:** 

Mr. Caesar	Yes
Mr. Witt	Yes
Mr. Emerson	Yes
Mr. Broughton	Yes
Ms. Milam	Yes
Mr. Willard	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE EXCUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

### Davonna Milam reentered the meeting.

- X. <u>NEW BUSINESS</u>. None.
- XI. <u>ADJOURNMENT</u>. The Board adjourned by general consent.

## OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through M.

AARON S. EMERSON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

JENELLE LEPOINT, SECRETARY TO THE BOARD OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD